# Problematizing a Research and Development Agenda

#### Alan Schoenfeld ACME 3 Opening Conference

My goal for today and tomorrow (CCME3 Conference) is to explore this issue:

If you had 5 things to focus on in order to build classrooms that produce students who are powerful thinkers, what would they be? My answer will be the "Teaching for Robust Understanding" (TRU) Framework.

#### Tomorrow...

I will go into detail into the framework, tools we have built, and our attempts to build supportive professional cultures. I will raise look for points of similarity and difference with what I know of Chinese pedagogical culture.

### Today...

I will start by framing the big questions, and show you how the framework evolved. I will raise a number of issues related to its origins, including how general a framework built with Western cultural assumptions might be.

# My Long-Term Goal:

Building Classrooms that produce students who are Powerful Thinkers

#### This has been a 45-year project!

#### I began with problem solving:

#### From 1975 to 1985

I developed a theory of proficiency in problem solving indicating that the following determine success or failure:

- The knowledge base
- Problem solving strategies
- Monitoring and self-regulation
- Belief systems.

You may recognize this...

#### \_\_\_MATHEMATICAL\_\_\_ PROBLEM SOLVING

ALAN H. SCHOENFELD

### But that's about individuals and learning. What about understanding teaching?

# It took another 20 years to understand teaching and, more generally, decision-making.

# Think

A Theory of Goal-Oriented Decision-Making and its Educational Applications

#### Alan H. Schoenfeld

# But that just focuses on one (essential) member of the classroom.

The question is, how do we focus effectively on the environment, and on the student experience? Can we use the framework to improve instruction? To do so a framework must be coherent and focused on the right things.

#### That's why I start with this big question:

If you had 5 things to focus on in order to build classrooms that produce students who are powerful thinkers, what would they be?

### Why 5 (or fewer)?

It's as many as most people can keep in mind. (In fact, it may be too many to work on at one time.)

If you have 20, you might as well have none. People can't keep that many things in their heads, and long check lists don't help. What matters is what people can act on, in teaching and coaching.

# What properties should those 5 things have?

They're all you need (there's nothing essential missing).

They each have a certain "integrity" and can be worked on in meaningful ways. Their framing supports professional growth.

# But I didn't know that was the question to ask when I began the research.

# So, I will take you on a brief tour of some years of unsuccessful research.

#### Will the (Western) literature help?

There are lots of frameworks.

- *Framework for Teaching* (or FFT, developed by Charlotte Danielson of the Danielson Group),
- *Classroom Assessment Scoring System* (or CLASS , developed by Robert Pianta, Karen La Paro, and Bridget Hamre at UVA
- Protocol for Language Arts Teaching Observations (or PLATO, developed by Pam Grossman at Stanford University),
- *Mathematical Quality of Instruction* (or MQI, developed by Heather Hill of Harvard University)
- UTeach Teacher Observation Protocol (or UTOP, developed by Michael Marder and Candace Walkington at the University of Texas-Austin).
- *Instructional Quality Assessment*, IQA, developed by the University of Pittsburgh.

#### Actually, No.

They all focus on important things, but they're all partial, or scattered, or have too many random parts; in some way or other none are close enough to use. They get at different things. So, we needed to build our own. Here's our first try, in outline form.

#### We tried coding lessons, focusing on these things:

	Access (what the teacher gives/allows)	Accountability (what the teacher expects/demands)	Productive Dispositions (what the teacher receives from students)
Strand	Dimensions (codes)	Dimensions (codes)	Dimensions (codes)
Mathematics	Students are able to experience the vibrancy and power of the domain of mathematics	Mathematical exploration and discussion should be accurate. Reasoning and justification should be tied to mathematics.	Students construct mathematics, attempting to discover rather than just receive.
Mathematics Learning	Students are given a chance to learn mathematics. This requires making making mathematics learning practices explicit and accessible.	Students are expected to engage productively in the mathematics learning process, sustain efforts, and contribute to finding solutions.	Students are interested in learning mathematics.
Classroom Community	No students are marginalized in the classroom community. All students have a chance to engage and participate.	Students have an obligation to their teacher and peers to be respectful and helpful. Students are not just participants but leaders of the classroom community.	Students contribute and participate as a community of mathematics practicioners.
Individual Learner	The classroom respects the uniqueness of each individual student, and gives appropriate affordances.	Students have an obligation to themselves to learn mathematics, and productively engage the subject matter.	Students sustain efforts as learners. Students take risks and believe that they can succeed.

#### It was impossible because of the detail we needed:

Strand	Access (all students have opportunities to engage the Strand subject)		Accountability (students are held to high standards)		Dispositions (student needs are met; students have productive dispositions)		Authority (students have ownership over their engagement with the subject)	
	Dimension	Constructs (codes)	Dimension	Constructs (Codes)	Dimension	Constructs (Codes)	Dimension	Constructs (Codes)
		a) tasks provide opportunities to engage higher-level mathematical thinking		a) teacher and students use multiple representations and make connections between representations; task requires multiple representations and connections between them. b) teacher presses for accuracy c) teacher asks probing questions/elicits reasoning and justification d) teacher and students use academic language e) teacher checks for understanding and provides feedback during instruction				
	1-1. Access to rich	way that demand rich mathematical	to the	knowledge, connects mathematical	3-1. Students view	b) useful	4-1. Authority over	b) students question, challenge,
Mathematics	mathematics	engagement	mathematics	ideas	mathematics as:		mathematical ideas	evaluate ideas
Mathematics Learning	1-2. Access to Explicit Expectations (taken from Ball's MQI)	<ul> <li>a) teacher is explicit about what students have to do on a given problem</li> <li>b) teacher is explicit about how to use formal math language</li> <li>c) teacher is explicit about how to reason mathematically</li> </ul>	2-2 Accountable to mathematics learning	<ul> <li>a) teacher expects students to be able to learn mathematics</li> <li>b) teacher expect students to persist in mathematics learning</li> </ul>	3-2. Students believe mathematics learning:	a) is achieved through hard work b) requires collaboration c) is rewarding/interesting	4-2. Authority to guide learning processes	<ul> <li>a) students facilitate discussions</li> <li>b) students manage logistics</li> <li>c) students set the agenda/have</li> <li>choice in activities</li> </ul>
Classroom Community	1-3. Opportunity to Receive (and Give) Meaningful, Constructive Feedback:	a) teacher provides feedback b) students give and receive feedback from other students	2-3. Accountable to classmates	a) discussion among students is math-focused c) teacher relates and connects student ideas to one another d) teacher revoices/marks student contributions e) students question and evaluate each other and teacher	3-3. Dispositions toward classmates	a) students show respect for each others' ideas	4-3. Authority is distributed appropriately throughout the class** **In our scheme, we should be careful to differentiate between normative and non- normative descriptors; it shouldn't look like the ideal is for students to have all the authority and teachers none, or vice versa.	a) across the teacher and the students* b) between pre-existing ideas and ideas generated by the class* *captured by three kinds of "who" in codes cited above: 1) teacher, 2) students, and 3) explicit teacher support for students to engage in X (some codes also imply the additional "who" of outside authorities, such as textbooks or some "They" that might make the rules)
Individual Learner	1-4. Opportunity to Engage the Mathematics in Their Own Way.	a) teacher permits use of non- dominant language b) students engage the mathematics on their own level c) teacher provides students time to work independently d) tasks have multiple entry points e) problem contexts respect students' cultural backgrounds/prior knowledge	2-4. Accountable to themselves	a) students have a role as mathematical authorities b) students sustain efforts to reach learning goals c) students participate in classroom activities	3-4. Students feel:	a) like individuals capable of learning math b) it's okay to make mistakes c) like they have a mathematical future - from Davis & Seashore rubric	4-4. Students acquire authority through competence.	a) teacher positions students as competent b) teacher positions students as *capable* of doing the math - from Ball's MQI and Cohen's complex instruction

Code #	Feasible in Real-time?	Focus Area	Time Scale	Spatial Scale	Description of Code	ACCESS	ACCOUNTABILITY	DISPOSITIONS	AUTHORITY
TEACHER	र								
1T	Y	Teacher	Lesson	Whole Class	When setting up a task, teacher checks whether students understand the directions	1-a: Explicit Expectations about - what to do on a given task		3-1. Teacher responds to students' disposition toward mathematics as	
2Т	Y	Teacher	ter Lesson Whole Class - Teacher checks for understanding, (an absolute count of unmber of times we observe this, sinther formally through quick-and-diry formative in assessments, or informally through quick-and-diry formative interactions of the count and singht quality outsoin and the sinther to assess the count and singht quality outsoin and the sinther to assess the count and singht quality outsoin and the sinther to assess the sinther to asses		3-1. Teacher responds to students' disposition toward mathematics as				
зт	3T Y Teacher Lesson Whole Class / Teacher pushes for conceptual understanding (e.g., through to rich mathematics? (No the Math Stand area mathematics) (No the Math Stand area math Stand are		3-1. Teacher responds to students' disposition toward mathematics as	4-a: Students positioned as competent (which gives them authority)					
4T	4T Y Teacher Lesson Whole Class / Teacher asks students to justifylexplain their reasoning. Its about how to reason in math								
5T	ST Y Teecher Lesson Whole Class / Small Group Classify and the class / Teacher prompts students to respond to each other's ideas Teedback, from other tabents and the classify and the classifier of the		1-b: Authority to - question, challenge, evaluate math ideas						
6Т	6T Y Teacher Lesson Whole Class / Small Group Teacher solicits student ideas. 1947 Teacher solicitsta student ideas. 1947		3-2 Teacher responds to students' disposition toward mathematics learning	1-a: Authority to - generate/explain math ideas					
7Т	Y	Teacher	Lesson	Whole Class	Teacher takes up or ignores a student idea. [How does it work to have both "taking up" and "ignoring" as the same code? -NLL]	-		to students' disposition toward mathematics	1-a: Authority to - generate/explain math ideas
8T	Y	Teacher	Lesson	Whole Class / Small Group	Teacher builds on students' prior mathematical knowledge [I need an example here more than on the others; what would this look like? -NLL]	2-b: Engaging the Math in Own Way - on their own math level			
7 Teacher Lesson / Unit Whole Class Unit Whole Class 1 Teacher - Lesson / Unit Whole Class		Teacher pushes students toward mathematical accuracy and toward formal math terminology (maybe examples would be, "teacher explicitly teachers mathematical language and vocabulary," and/or "teacher revoices student ideas in formal mathematical language." I think is is feasible to code these in real time. •NLL]	1-b: Explicit Expectations about - using formal math terminology	2-1: Accountability to the Math					
	7 Teacher Unit - h		Teacher makes future-oriented statements about kids using or droing math in the future in some way (Davis & Seashore have a 4-point rubric in their scheme we can look at; We also could make a tally of the number of such statements that occur over the course of a unit; Or, we could just tally yes/ino per lesson and then analyze the pattern over the course of the unit).	3-a: Access to Productive Identities - envisioning a mathematical future					
	Teacher Unit - Teacher makes an encouraging remark that may, for example, forter persistence or position students as capable identities - teamers (We could make a taily of the number of such statements that occur over the ocurse of a unit)		3-b: Access to Productive Identities - students positioned as capable learners		4-a: Students see themselves as capable	1-a: Authority to explain/generate math ideas 4-a: Students positioned as competent (which gives them authority)			
	N Teacher Lesson Whole Class / Small Group Wait time. (calculate the average time a teacher waits for		2-c: Engaging the Math in Own Way - students have independent work/think						

STUDENTS

Task

Task Lesson

Lesson

4S	Y	Students	Lesson	Whole Class / Small Group	Class / Group Students justify/explain their reasoning		1: Accountability to the Math		1-a: Authority to - generate/explain mat ideas
55	Y	Students	Lesson	Whole Class / Small Group	Students question and evaluate mathematical ideas, whether they come from the teacher or from classmates. (an absolute count - this may happen in whole group discussion or small-group work)	dents question and evaluate mathematical ideas,			1-b: Authority to - question, challenge, evaluate math ideas
6S	Y	Students	Lesson	Whole Class / Small Group	Students share new ideas.			3-3. Students dispositions toward classroom community (classmates or the teacher)	1-a: Authority to - generate/explain mat ideas
95	Y	Students	Unit	Whole Class / Small Group	Students facilitate whole-class or small group discussions (yes/no)			3-3. Students dispositions toward classroom community (classmates or the teacher)	2-a: Authority over classroom activity - facilitating discussion
10S	Y	Students	Lesson / Unit	Whole Class	Students are responsible for logistical tasks (e.g., passing out papers) - (yes/no)	-		3-4. Students dispositions toward individual/self-efficacy	2-b: Authority over classroom activity - managing logistics
115	Y	Students	Lesson	Whole Class / Small Group	Especially in classes with ELL students, students are observed using non-dominant language in class without sanction from teacher (yes/no).	2-a: Engaging the Math in Own Way - through use of non-dominant language		3-3. Students dispositions toward classroom community (classmates or the teacher)	4-a: Students positioned as competent (which giv them authority)
125	Y	Students	Lesson	Whole Class / Small Group	Participation is distributed fairly across students so that no handful of students dominate discussion	2-c: Engaging the Math in Own Way - students have independent work/think time		3-3. Students dispositions toward classroom community (classmates or the teacher)	
	N	Students	Lesson	-	% of time students spend working on math independently (compared with time spent on teacher talking about math or classroom management)	2-c: Engaging the Math in Own Way - students have independent work/think time		3-4. Students dispositions toward individual/self-efficacy	
	?	Students	Lesson / Unit	Whole Class	Students participate in setting lesson agenda and structuring activities (e.g., who to work with, how much time spent on an activity etc.) - (yes/no)	-		3-1. Teacher responds to students' disposition toward mathematics as	2-c: Authority over classroom activity - setting lesson agend
TASK									
4K	Y	Task	Lesson	-	Task requires students to justify, conjecture, interpret		1: Accountability to the Math	3-1: Nature of mathematics	
	N	Task	Lesson		Task affords multiple entry points for students.	2-b: Engaging the Math in Own Way - on their own math level		3-1: Nature of mathematics	4-4b: Students are positioned as competent/capable
						2-b: Engaging the Math in	1: Accountability to	3-1: Nature of	

Task affords multiple representations

Tasks have real-world applications

Own Way - on their own

the Math

athematics 3-1: Nature of

thematics

There were codes For teacher, students, And task along All the dimensions. It was unworkable.

## We tried again, simplifying by looking at "Events of Interest." That got complex very fast...

Events of interest			
Part 3: CAT-specific	Sub-Category	Event #	Description of Event
Events			
		1	Participants rephrase/reword the problem context to put it in more kid- friendly language.
		2	Teacher checks that students understand non-mathematical vocabulary.
A. Navigating Language		3	Teacher checks that students understand mathematical vocabulary.
		4	Evie: use of reading strategies, students being asked to read aloud or in small groups, word walls, use of personal dictionaries, sentence frames, sentence starters
		5	Teacher asks questions that call students attention to relevant quantities (e.g., What is the problem asking you to find? or What does the problem give you?)
B. Identifying Relevant C	Quantities	6	Evie: Students connect quantities, operations, relationships, and calculations to reasoning around context.
, ,		7	Evie: Students make sense of the quantities required to solve the problem.
		8	Evie: Students articulate goals or strategies for solving problem connected to reasoning around context.
		9	Participants make explicit connections between inputs and outputs (vs. relying on recursive rules).
	C-1. Articulating Mathematical Relationships Between Quantities	10	Participants engage in qualitative sense-making of relationships between quantities.
		11	Participants reference a family/families of functions and their features.
	C-2. Generating Representations	12	Kim: Students choose which representation to use
		13	Kim/Dan: Students construct a representation (e.g., equation, graph, table).
C. Representing		14	Bob: Teacher asks the students to construct a representation / The task requires students to construct a representation.
Relevant Quantities		15	Alan: The representation is tied in a meaningful or useful way to the context of the problem.
		16	Participants move between representations.
		17	Participants use representations to solve contextual problems.
	C-3. Interpreting or Making	18	Participants compare the advantages and/or limitations of various representations.
	Representations	19	Evie: participants make connections among representations (it's not just comparing representations, like "I like the table better than a graph"; it's about seeing how the rate of change, for example, shows up in the table and in the graph)
	D-1. Making Calculations or	20	Bob: Teacher emphasizes arithmetical accuracy or providing opportunities for students to do calculations correctly (providing resources, etc.)
	Executing Procedures	21	Participants solve an equation for a variable.
D. Solving the Problem		22	Participants use algebraic techniques to solve systems of equations (substitution, elimination, etc. vs. guess-and-check)
	D-2. Attending to the Problem Context to Check the Plausibility of Results or Making Sense of Quantities	23	Participants orally reference the problem context in explaining their wor Or Participants reference the problem context in explaining their work in writing.
E. Justifying and		24	?????
Explaining Reasoning		25	?????
	1		

#### So we abandoned that approach as well.

Every approach we took resulted in our looking at a large amount of detail.

We listed hundreds of things that were important to notice. We incorporated everything from the literature and our observations...

CTI	UN 4.1 2011-11-3				
	Facet				
					-
	Giving Directions (for Individual or	*Setting Process Expectations*	* Setting Product Expectations*		
_	Group Work)	Teacher tells students to get started without	Teacher tells students to get started without		
		Teacher sate process expectations (a.g.	Takther refer expectations along final conduct		
		2 amount of time for task, how students should organize themselves).	2 (e.g., by providing a scoring rubric, showing examples of high quality work).		
		setting process expectations.	<sup>3</sup> expectations for final product.		
8	Summarizing the Math Discussed	Who is Doing the Summarizing?	What is the Nature of the Math Being Summarized?		
		1	1		
		,	,		
		-	-		
		3	3		
		-	-		
с	Connecting to	Who is Involved in Creating the	What is the Nature of the Math Being		
_	Prior Knowledge	Connections to Prior Knowledge?	Connected?		
		3	3		
	Positioning	Who is Being Positioned as Canable	How/Why is the Math Being Learned	What Does it Take to Be	
	Relative to Task	of Doing the Math?	Relevant/Useful?	Successful in Math?	
		doesn't position them relative to the task. Teacher positions students as canable of	1 important/relevant to students.	ability.	
		2 working on a difficult task, but addresses students in a general way (e.g., you guys	reacher tarks about the importance of 2 mathematics for students in a general sense (e.e., you does really need to be a Birth	2 Teacher emphasizes the importance of effort.	
		can do this). Teacher is explicit in positioning ALL students	Utility of math is addressed specifically (e.g.	Teacher emphasizes the importance of	
		3 as capable of working on the task (e.g., multiple ability treatment).	3 students are positioned as having mathematical futures).	3 effort AND the need to be persistent in the face of difficulty.	
_	Teacher				
ŧ	Exposition of Mathematical	[Incorporating Ideas from Class Discussion into Exposition]	[Depth/Quality of the Math in the Exposition]		
	Ideas	1 Teacher ignores or dismisses student	1		
		reasoning. Teacher acknowledges contribution but design artificative incorrection if into the lesson			
		2 (e.g., that's an interesting idea, but we're not working on that now).	2		
		3 Teacher incorporates and builds on student	3		
		responsed to a segment of the segment of the sector of the			
	Discussing				
	Mathematica		territoria de la companya de la comp	[How Student Responses are	Encouraging Multiple Solution
	Ideas/Reasoning	[Facilitating Discussion Participants]	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]	[Encouraging Multiple Solution Paths]
	Ideas/Reasoning	[Facilitating Discussion Participants] Only the first student that raises his/her hand is the one that gets called on.	[Eliciting Student Reasoning] Teacher does not attempt to further explicate student's thinking.	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]	[Encouraging Multiple Solution Paths] The task/introduction strongly suggests a single solution path.
	Ideas/Reasoning	[Facilitating Discussion Participants] Only the first student that raises his/her hand is the one that gets called on. Beyond the first student, at least one other 2 student who raised his/her hand gets called on to research to a elsem outseline.	[Eliciting Student Reasoning] Teacher does not attempt to further explicate student's thinking. Teacher attempts to explair/re-phrase the student's thinking.	[How Student Responses are Taken Up] 1 2	[Encouraging Multiple Solution Paths] 1 The task/introduction strongly suggest a single solution path. 2 The task/introduction affords multiple potential solution paths.
	Ideas/Reasoning	[Facilitating Discussion Participants] Only the first student that raises higher hand is the one that gets called on. Beyond the first student, as least one other 2 student who raised higher hand gets called on to respond to a given question. Teacher uses techniques to actively engage 3 students and one of valuence (a.e., wat	[Eliciting Student Reasoning] Tracher does not attempt to further explicate student's thinking. 2 Teacher attempts to explain/re-phrase the student's thinking. 3 Teacher probes student to further explicate	[How Student Responses are Taken Up] 1 2 3	[Encouraging Multiple Solution Paths] The task/hdroduction strongy supports a single solution path. The task/hdroduction affords multiple potential solution path. Ine task/hdroduction affords multiple encourages/requires multiple solution
	Ideas/Reasoning	[Pacilitating Discussion Participants] Only the first student that raises having hand is the one that gets called on. Beyond the first student, at least one other student who raised husker hand gets called on to respond to a given question. Teacher uses techniques to actively enjoye 3 student who do not volumere (r0.4, wait teme, popole acts, cond calling).	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]  Tacher des not attempt to further explicate studenty theking. Tacher attempt to asylarive-phrase the attempt temaing. Tacher protects student to further explicate hurber strategy/threating.	[How Student Responses are Taken Up] 1 2 3	[Encouraging Multiple Solution Paths] The task/introduction strongly suggest a single solution path. The task/introduction affinds multiple potential solution path. Inte task/introduction paths and/or the contrast of different solution.
	Ideas/Reasoning Monitoring	(Pacilitating Discussion Participants) Chyle he first student that rease in/per- hands alte one that gets called on. Beyood the first student, at least one atter- t student who stead hyler hand gets called on to respond to a given question. Techner unes tenden hyler hand gets called on to respond to a given question. Techner unes tenden hyler hand gets called on to respond to a given question. Techner unes tenden hyler hand gets called a stadent who also not volationer (s.g., while tende, peptick stroks, cold calleg).	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]  1 Student's Moling, 2 Student's Moling, 2 Student's Moling, 2 Student's Moling, 2 Student's Moling, 3 Nucher student to Further explicate 3 Nucher strategy/thinking,	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]	[Encouraging Huiliple Solution Paths] 1 The task/ntroduction strongly suggests a single solution path. 2 The task/ntroduction affects multiple post and non-path solutions. 5 Just a solution solutions.
G	Ideas/Reasoning Monitoring Whole Class Understanding -	Charlitating Discussion Participants]     Only the first student that nears hyterin Only the first student that nears in yither that a the over this spin called as, once that the spin called as, once the spin called as a spin called as, there are starbingers to activity engaged there, projects stude, and they are there, projects stude, and they are there, projects stude, and they are there, because the Match Beiling Assessed?     Most Deep was the Match Beiling Assessed?	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]            * Student dees not attimut to hurther explored students? Initiation.           2 "Student attimut to burther explored students? Initiation.           3 "Student probles student to hurther explored students? Initiation.           3 "Student probles student to hurther explored students? Initiation.           How Many Students are We Getting Data Proof?	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]	[Encouraging Huttiple Solution Paths]  1 The talk/introduction strongly suggest 2 potential (solution path). 2 potential (solution path). 3 paths and/or the contrast of different solutions.
G	Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL	Chart the first student that races ins/ine- Conv the first student that races ins/ine- hand at the ore that gets called as. Conv the first student that races ins/ine- that the student that races ins/ine- that the student that the student that the student the race ins/ine- the student the student that the student the student that the student that the student that the student that the student that the student that the student that the student that the student the student that the student that the student the student that the student that the student that the student that the student that the student that the student that the student that the student that the student that the student that the student that the student the student that the student the student the student that the student the student the student the s	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]            * Student dees not attimute to there explore students' history.           * Student's history.           * Number probes student to further explorate student's history.           * Number probes student to further explorate student's history.           * Number probes student are We Getting Data From?	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]  What Does the Teacher Do with This Information?	[Cnourseping Nutliple Solution Paths] The land/normalicelise strongy suggest a single solution path. 2) The tail/introduction affinist multiple pointerial solution paths. Intel tail/introduction affinist multiple paths and/or the cortisas of affirent solution.
G	Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL	Chrythe first student that races ins/ine- Chrythe first student that races ins/ine- hand at the cert that gets called an. hand at the cert that gets called an. that the student that races ins/ine- account the race first/en- tabletts and a given question. The center uses terthingent to activity magnet tabletts and an given question. The monitoring any invalved checking the monitoring and to act the assessed?	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]	[Cncourseping Nutliple Solution Paths] The lack/nonsolution ethnoly suggest a single solution path. The taxynomychicine pointersial solution paths. Inter taxynomychicine Spaths and/or the contrast of different solutions.
G	Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL	Chry the first student, strates ins/ine- Chry the first student, strates ins/ine- Inequality of the first student, at least one other Inequality of the first student, at least one other Inequality of the strate strate strates Inequality of the strates of the strates of the strates Inequality of the strates of the strates of the strates Inequality of the strates of the strates of the strates Inequality of the strates of the strates of the strates Inequality of the strates of the strates of the strates of the strates Inequality of the strates of the str	[Eliciting Student Reasoning] <sup>1</sup> Student does not attimate to horber explorate students history. <sup>2</sup> Tachter attangs to explanite spinare students history. <sup>3</sup> Tachter probes student to further explorate students history. <sup>3</sup> Tachter probes student to further explorate students history. <sup>1</sup> Tachter probes student to further explorate to horber explorate. <sup>1</sup> Tachter probes students are We Getting Data From?           1           2	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]	[Incourse)ing Hutiple Solution Paths] <sup>1</sup> The lady-formulation set of the solution <sup>2</sup> The task/instructions affinds multiple <sup>2</sup> Details adv/instruction affinds <sup>2</sup> into task/instruction affinds <sup>2</sup> and adv/instruction affinds <sup>2</sup> adv/instruction affinds <sup>3</sup> adv/instru
G	Ideas/Reasoning Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL	Cracillating Discussion Participants)     Only the first student that names try/ter- hand a the result ways of relief.     Only the first student that names try/ter- ter and the result of the start of relief.     Subscription of the start of the start of the start the start who make high the start of the start the start who make high the start of the start there, expected the start of the start of the start there, expected the start of the start the measure gray marked the start the measure gray marked the starts the measure gray the start is assessed procedure.     The measure gray marked the starts procedure and the starts assessed procedure.     The measure gray can start to equation.     The measure gray starts the starts assessed procedure.     The measure gray execution.     The measure gray execution.     The measure gray execution.     The measurement of the starts to equation.     The measureme	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]           1 "State data not attimpt to hurther explored students finisher           2 "State attempt to scalarly explore students finisher           3 "State attempt to scalarly explore students finisher           4 "Bank attempt to scalarly explore students finisher           1 "Bank attempt to scalarly explore students finisher           1 Bank attempt to scalarly explore bank explore students are we detting Data From?           1           2           3	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]  What Does the Teacher Do with This Information?  What 2 2 3	[Incourse)ing Nutliple Solution Paths] <sup>1</sup> The lady-introduction attracts <sup>2</sup> The lady-introduction attracts <sup>2</sup> The task/introduction attracts <sup>2</sup> The task/introduction <sup>2</sup> another applications paths. <sup>2</sup> The task/introduction <sup>2</sup> another applications paths <sup>2</sup> another applications paths <sup>2</sup> another applications paths <sup>2</sup> another applications attracts <sup>2</sup> another applications <sup>2</sup> another appl
G	Ideas/Ressoning Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL	Charite First student that near service that the first student that near service that the set of self and the set of the reasons of a mathematical procedure.     The measure set of self and the set of self and the reasons of a mathematical procedure.     The measure set of a mathematical set of the reasons of the re	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]  What Does the Teacher Do with This Information?  Main Statement Stat	[Choosenging HotLiple Solution Paths] The LauAnendoction strong suggest a single solution path. 2) The LauAnendoction affinet multiple potential solution paths. encompany/mounts multiple paths and/or the centrast of different solutions.
G	Ideas/Ressoning Monitoring Whole Clas Unferstanding - INFORMAL Monitoring Whole Class	Christificating Discussion Participants)     Chry the first student that names hybrid that and the set of all and the set of th	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]           1 "Stacker does not attinget to the Number explored students' history.           2 "Stacker attempts to explanitive phrase the students' history.           3 "Stacker probes student to further explored students' history.           4 Were strategy thready.           1 "Stacker probes students to reverte explored backer attempt to explanitive phrase.           How Many Students are We Getting Data Proof.           1           2           3	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]  What Does the Teacher Do with This Information?  What Joes the Teacher Do with This Information?	[Chourseping HutLiple Solution Paths] The LauAntendediction strongy support a single solution path. 2) The LauAntendediction affords multiple potential solution path. Intel Examplements and a solution of paths and/or the central of different solution.
G	Ideas/Reasoning Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - JHFORMAL Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - FORMAL	Christificating Discussion Participants)     Christificating Discussion Participants)     Christificating Christian Christian     Christificating Christian Christian     Christificating Christian     Christian Christian     Christian	[Eliciting Student Reasoning] <sup>1</sup> Stacker does not attempt to the their explore student's history. <sup>2</sup> Tacher attempt to explanite up to student's income.           3 Tacher probes student to further explore student's income.           How Many Students are We Getting Data Prem?           1           2           3	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]  What Does the Teacher Do with This Information?	[Chooseping HotLiple Solution Paths] The LackAntroduction strongy support a single solution path. The LackAntroduction affords multiple pointersial solution paths. The Easy International Paths pointersial solution paths. The Easy International Paths and Paths and the Contrast of althrest solution.
G	Ideas/Reasoning Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - JINFORMAL Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - FORMAL	Christian in the first student that races ins/iner hand is the cert that sees ins/iner a student the race ins/iner hand sets in the second hand is the regard of the second hand is the regard of the second hand is the second hand hand hand hand hand hand hand ha	[Eliciting Student Reasoning] <sup>1</sup> Sacker data not attempt to horber explorate students history.           2 Tacker attempt to explanitive phrase the students' missing.           3 Tacker probes student to further explorate students' missing.           4 New Many Students are We Getting Data From?           1           2           3           How Many Students are We Getting Data From?           1           2           3	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]  Value What Does the Teacher Do with This Information?	[Incourseing Multiple Solution Paths] The lack/nonduction strongly support a single solution path. The tak/nonduction affinds multiple pointersial solution paths. Inter tak/nonduction affinds pointersial solution paths. Inter tak/nonduction Solutions.
G	Ideas/Reasoning Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - FORMAL	Cracititating Discussion Participants)     Conv the first student that asses try/ter- hand a first that spits check and the set of the set	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]           1 "Stacker daes not atting to the huther explored students history.           2 "Subtra atting to be plan (be plan at butter to be plan (be plan at be plan at be plan at butter to be plan at be plan at be plan at butter to be plan at be plan at be plan at butter to be plan at be plan at be plan at but at plan at be plan at be plan at be plan at butter to be plan at be plan at butter to be plan at be plan at be plan at butter to be plan	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]  Value What Does the Teacher Do with This Information?	[Incourseing Hutiple Solution Paths] The Lack/Instructions aftersy support is analysishing of the solution path of the solution of the solution paths and solution of the contrast of different address.
G	Ideas/Reasoning Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - FORMAL	Chart the first student that near bury to be a set of the set	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]           1 "Stacker does not atting to the huther explored students' history.           2 "Sucher attempts to explanyte uprase the dutations' history.           3 "Stacker probes student & further explored students' history.           4 More Many Students are We Getting Data From?           1           2           3	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]  What Does the Teacher Do with This Information?  Main Statement Stat	[Choosenging HotLiple Solution Paths] The LauAnendediction strong support a single solution path. 2) The LauAnendediction affords multiple potential solution paths. encompanying interpret paths and/or the central of different abilities.
G	Ideas/Ressoning Monitaring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL Monitaring Whole Class Understanding - FORMAL	Chart the first student that nears in/time     Conv the first student that nears in/time     The data the origin that special call on other     that a strength of the special call on other     the start of the special call of the special call on the regard of the special call call call call call call call	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]           1 "Stacker dees not attempt to be the horther explored students' histories."           2 "Stacker attempts to explany're-phrase the students' histories."           3 "Rober attempts to explany're-phrase the students' histories."           1 "Backer attempts to explany're-phrase the students' histories."           1 "Backer attempts to explany're-phrase Data Prom?           1 "Backer attempts to explany're-phrase Data Prom?           1 .           2 .           1 .           2 .           3 .	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]  What Does the Teacher Do with This Information?  What Does the Teacher Do with This Information?	[Chourseping HutLiple Solution Paths] The Lau/Antroduction strong vapper is angle solution path. The Solution path. The Solution path. The Example values of the Solution path operation advancements of the Solution paths and the Solution path. The Solution paths of the Solution paths and the Solution path. The Solution paths of the Solution paths and the Solution paths of the Solution paths advancements of the Solution paths advancem
G	Ideas/Reasoning Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - FORMAL Student Seeks to	Chry the first student that nears in/time     The first student that nears in/time     The first student that nears in/time     the first student that near in/time     the set of the first student that near in/time     the set of the first student that near in/time     the set of the first student that near in/time     the set of the near in/time     the near in/time     the set of the near in/time     the near in/tim     the near in/time     the near in/time     the near in/time	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]           1 "State des not attempt to the Nuther explore students" history.           2 "State attempt to explanite desting students" history.           3 "State probes student to further explore students" history.           How Many Students are We Getting Data Prem?           1           2           3	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]  What Does the Teacher Do with This Information?	[Chooseping Hotiple Solution Paths] The land/horthodicities strongly support a single solution path. The taky/horthodicities affords multiple pointers and solution paths. The taky/horthodication affords multiple pointers and solution paths. The taky/horthodication affords and the pointers and solution paths. The taky/horthodication affords and the solution.
G	Ideas/Ressoning Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL Monitoring Weinke Class Understanding - FORMAL Student Seeks to Clarify Mathematical	Chart the first student that mass insystem Chart the first student that mass insystem Deny the first student that mass insystem Energy and the student that mass insystem Subset the mass insystem attack whe mass in the student that the student that mass in the student that the student that mass in the student that the student that mass is the student that the student mass is the student to explain mass is the student	[Eliciting Student Reasoning] <sup>1</sup> Stacker does not attempt to the horber explored student's history. <sup>2</sup> Tacher attempt to explanite the student's history. <sup>3</sup> Tacher probes student to further explored student's history. <sup>4</sup> Norther probes student to further explored student's history. <sup>1</sup> Tacher probes student to further explored student's history. <sup>1</sup> Norther probes student to further explored base Prem? <sup>1</sup> Norther probes students are We Getting Data Prem? <sup>1</sup> <sup>2</sup> <sup>3</sup> Norther prem? <sup>1</sup> <sup>2</sup> <sup>3</sup> <sup>1</sup> How Many Students are We Getting Data Prem? <sup>1</sup> <sup>2</sup> <sup>3</sup> <sup>1</sup> How Cognitively Demanding is the Student's Dustion?	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]  What Does the Teacher Do with This Information?  How is the Question Taken Up?	[Cnourseping HutLiple Solution Paths]  The tax/sortexture set of the solution
G	Ideas/Reasoning Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - FORMAL Student Seeks to Calify Hateriatical Ideas/Reveals Confusion	Chart the first student that areas to type Chart the first student that areas to type Chart the first student that areas to type and the first student that areas to type acceleration of the state student that acceleration of the state student to equilibrium acceleration of the states students to acceleration of the states students to acceleration of a student states acceleration	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]           1 "State dees not attempt to humber explored students' humber, download to be address to be address to students' humber, attempt to explore explored students' humber attempt to explore explored to the explored to be address are we detting Data From?           1	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]	[Chourseping HotLiple Solution Paths] The Lack/Instructure strongy support is a single solution path. The Lack/Instructure strong solution is a single solution path. The Company solut
G	Ideas/Ressoning Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - FORMAL Student Seeks to Clarify Mathematical Confusion	[Catilitating Discussion Participants]           Chry the first studiet that areas try/time hand a the orat that gets called any other bands and the oratic studiet that areas try/time bands and the oratic studiet that areas try/time inter-species studiet, and any other association of the studiet that areas try/time time, species studiet, cold calling).           Inter-species studiet, cold calling).           Inter-species studiet, cold calling).           Inter-species studiet, cold calling).           The mentioning study calling and the studiets to a studiet and the studiet that assessing a studiet and the studiet and the states are species studiet, and the studiet to registant the mentioning studiet studiets to registant the mentioning studiet studiets to registant a streament of a studie menumeration are species.           The mentioning studiet studiets to registant the mentioning studiet studiets to registant assesses (2, 4, - The amount of young call of the stream).           The mentioning studiet studiets to registant assesses (2, 4, - The amount of young call of the stream).           The mentioning studiet studiets to registant their resorting or answer a stream question.           How Coognitively Demending in the Response?           How Coognitively Demending in the Response?           How Coognitively Demending in the Response?	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]           1 "State data not atting to the human explored students' history."           2 "Subtra atting to explanitive presente students' history."           3 "State atting to explanitive presente historie students' history."           1 More Analysis to explanitive presente historie students' historie explanation Data Present           1 Attack atting to explanative presente historie students' historie explanation Data Present           1 Attack atting to explanative Data Present           2 Attack atting to explanative Data Present           3 Attack atting to explanative Data Present           1 Attack atting to explanative Data Present           2 Attack atting to explanative Data Present           3 Attack attack attack attack attack attack Biodent's Questioner at exercision of Attack at	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]  What Does the Teacher Do with This Information?  Mov is the Question Taken Up? Advantaged but not responded to.	[Chooseaping Multiple Solution Paths]     The LandAntandoction strongy support a stage solution path.     The LandAntandoction affords multiple assign solution paths.     antanal and the contrast of different and and the contrast of different address
G	Ideas/Ressoning Monitaring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL Monitaring Whole Class Understanding - FORMAL Student Seeks to Clarify Mathematical Confusion	Christianting Discussion Participants)     Chry the first studient that nears bry/me     The probability of the start studient of that near the start studient of the start studient of the start studient of that near the start studient of the start	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]     Ischer des not attempt to human explored     students history.     Tacher attempts to explanite uptawers     Tacher attempts     Tacher attempt     Tacher attempts     Tacher	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]	[Chourseping Hotiple Solution Paths] The LandAntraduction strong valagest a single solution path. The LandAntraduction affords multiple potential solution path. The Example solution path. The Example solution path. The Example solution paths and the Contrast of affords and the Cont
G	Ideas/Ressoning Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - FORMAL Student Seeks to Clarify Mathematical Ideas/Reveals Confusion	Classification Discussion Participants)     Conv the first student that mass invite Conv the first student that mass invite Even that the student that mass invite Even the mass invite and student that any other student who massed have the hand gets called more mass that parts in a student that There resolves the Math Being Assessed?     The resolves that is a with masses There resolves the Math Being Assessed? There resolves that is a with masses There resolves that is a masses There resolves that masses There resolves that the student to explain. There resolves that the student to explain. The	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]           1 "Sacket dees not attinget to the horther explored students' history.           2 "Sacket attempts to explanitive physics the students' history.           3 "Sacket attempts to explanitive physics the students' history.           4 Werk attempts to explanitive physics.           1 "Sacket students' history.           4 Werk attempts to explanitive physics.           1 Sacket students' history.           1 Attempt students are We Getting Data Prem?           1           2           3           How Many Students are We Getting Data Prem?           1           2           3           How Cognitively Demanding is the Student's Question?           1 Cost Lobert physics about whether at answer is a construct and the student's as "total ray but any but to get student's as "total ray but any but to get student's as "total ray but to any but to get student's as a peech quantum hourd.	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]      What Does the Teacher Do with This Information?      What Does the Teacher Do with This Information?      Mow is the Question Taken Up?      Advantaged but nut responded to. 2 Arguered by teacher.	[Incourseing Multiple Solution Paths] The tack/terrelation strategy support a single solution path. The takk/terrelation path. Th
G	Ideas/Reasoning Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL Student Seeks to Clarify Mathematical Ideas/Reveals Confusion	Chart the first student that areas try/term     Conv the first student that areas try/term     Conv the first student that areas try/term     Conv the first student that areas try/term     convertex the state student that areas try/term     student who areas the state area areas     student who areas the state area areas     the state student that areas try/term     the state state areas     the state student that areas try/term     the state state areas     the state areas     the state state areas     the state areas	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]           1 "State data not attempt to humber explored students history.           2 "Subtra attempt to implay the physics the students' history.           2 "Subtra attempt to implay the physics students' history.           3 "Subtra attempt to implay the physics humber students' history.           1 "Subtra attempt to implay the subtra attempt to implay the post from?           1 "Anne students' humber students' humber students' humber students' post from?           1           2           3 "Attempt to implay the Student's Question?           1           2           3 "           How Cognitively Demanding is the Student's Question?           1 The diadet stude with humber department in a compacting question (e.g., " Gath is not some attempt question (e.g., " Student's question in the student student's Question (e.g., " The student student of the student student, something works.	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]      U      What Does the Teacher Do with This Information?      What Does the Teacher Jow with This Information?      U      L	[Chourseping Multiple Solution Paths] The tack/nonduction strong vagged is angle solution path. 2) The tack/nonduction afficies multiple and control of the solution of the solution and control of the solution of the solution and control of the solution of the solution of the solution and control of the solution of the solution of the solution and control of the solution o
G	Ideas/Reasoning Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL Student Seeks to Clarify Student Seeks to Clarify Ideas/Reveals Confusion Scaffolding the	Chart the first student that areas try/set Chart the first student that areas try/set Chart the first student that areas try/set hand a first student that areas try/set hand a first student that areas try/set acceleration of the student that areas try/set acceleration of the student that areas try/set there are a student that area of the student there are a student that areas try/set acceleration of the student that areas there are a student that areas try/set there are a student that areas try/set acceleration of a mathematical to explain there areas try student to the states acceleration of a mathematical to explain there are a student to a student to explain there are avoing a student to the states acceleration of a mathematical to explain there areas try of the states that being acceleration of a mathematical to explain there areas try of the states that the states acceleration of a mathematical to explain there areas try of the states that the states acceleration of a mathematical areas that acceleration of a mathematical acceleration of a mathematical accelerat	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]           1 "State data not atting to the huther explored students history."           2 "Subtra atting to explanyte uprase the dutation in huther atting to explanyte uprase the students huther atting to explanyte uprase.           1 Work atting to explanyte uprase the dutation in huther atting to explanyte uprase.           1 Work atting to explanyte uprase the students huther atting to explanyte uprase.           1 Mow Many Students are We Getting Data From?           1           2           3           How Many Students are We Getting Data From?           1           2           3           How Cognitively Demanding is the Student's Question.           The student atak WHT isomething works.	Ifow Student Responses are Taken Up)      What Does the Teacher Do with This Information?      Mow is the Question Taken Up?      Advented by feacher.     Students engaged in answering it.	[The course ging Hot Liple Solution     Paths]     The LandAntraduction driving support     a single solution path.     The LandAntraduction driving support     a single solution path.     and the solution
G	Ideas/Ressoning Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL Student Seeks to Clarify Mathematical Confusion Scaffolding the Mathematics in	Christianting Discussion Participants]     Chry the first student that areas hy/me     Chry the first student that areas hy/me     chry the first student that areas hy/me     student areas hy/me     student areas hy/me     thore beep was the Hahn Being     Chry the mentaring that areas hy/me     thore beep was the Hahn Being     added being     thore beep was the Hahn Being     thore beep was the Hahn Being     added being     thore beep was the Hahn Being     the reasons of a northermal structure of the sensing     possible.     How Deep was the Hahn Being     there execute a structure of a submerger     possible.     How Deep was the Hahn Being     there execute a structure of a submerger     possible.     How Deep was the Hahn Being     added the sensing     added that the sensing     possible.     How Deep was the Hahn Being     added the sensing     added     added the sensing     ad	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]           1 "State data not atting to buther explore students history."           2 "Subter atting to buther explore students history."           3 "Subter atting to buther explore students history."           1 "State atting to but to buther explore students history."           1 "Subter students huther explore students history."           1 "Subter students huther explore students history."           1 "Data From?           2 "Subtest to but the state of the state Student's Question?           1 "Decoded take about about about about "Data From?           1 "Decoded take about about about "Data From?           1 "Decoded take about about about "Data From?           1 "Decoded take about about about "Data From?           1 "Detable take about about about "Data From?           1 "Detable take about about about "Data From?           2 "Data From?	[How Student Responses are Taken Up]      Value of the Construction     What Does the Teacher Do with This Information?      Max Does the Teacher Do with This Information?      Max Does the Teacher Do with This Information?      According to the Construction of the Construction     According to the Construction of the Const	[The course ging Hot Liple Solution     Paths]     The land/hot double solution     Solution     Solution     Solution
G	Ideas/Ressoning Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - FORMAL Student Seeks to Clarify	Chartitizating Discussion Participants)     Conv the first student that nears in/time     The data the order that ages called on     the data that the set of all of one	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]           1 "Sucher des not attingt to burble explore students history."           2 "Sucher attingt to explanitive phrase the students' history."           3 "Rother attingt to explanitive phrase the students' history."           How Many Students are We Getting Data From?           1           2           How Many Students are We Getting Data From?           1           2           How Cognitively Demanding is the Student's Question?           1           2           3           How Cognitively Demanding is the Student's Question?           1           2           3           How Cognitively Demanding is the Student's Question?           1           2           3           The data shard, whether are some or a conceptic question (e.g., 1'orn thing the get student)" for question hand.           3           The data shard, whether are some or a conceptic question (e.g., 1'orn thing the get student)" for question hand.           3           The data shard, whether are some or a conceptic question (e.g., 1'orn thing the get student)" for question hand.           3           The data shard, whether are some or a conceptic question (e.g., 1'orn thing the get student)" for question hand.           4		[The course ging Hot Liple Solution     Philes     The Hauth Interdection & Hotely Lipped     The Hauth Interdection & Hotely Lipped     The Hauth Interdection a Philes multiple     philes and/or the contrast of affirese     which in the contrast of affirese     which in the contrast of affirese
G	Ideas/Ressoning Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - INFORMAL Monitoring Whole Class Understanding - FORMAL Student Seeks to Clarify Mathematical Ideas/Reveals Confusion Scaffolding the Mathematics in the Tasks	Chart the first student that mass in tyles Chart the first student that mass in tyles Chart the first student that mass in tyles Chart the first student that mass in tyles Index the mass in tyles attacker who mass in tyles attacker who mass in tyles the mass in the student that mass more mass in the student that the student more mass in the student that the student The measurem party in type attack attacker that mass in tyles the student that the student that the attacker that the student that the student more mass in the student that the student there expected mass in the student to explain the measurem party in movied direction the measurem part to an anth measurem The measurem part of the student states The measurem part of th	[Eliciting Student Reasoning]           * "State data out attempt to hurther explored students flucture."           * "State attempt to implay the phrase the students flucture."           * The student to implay the phrase the students flucture."           * The student to implay the phrase the students flucture."           * The student to implay the phrase the students flucture."           * The student to implay the student students flucture."           * The student at a specific quantum about.           * The student as a specific quantum about.           * The student about a student strange students.           * The student about a student strange students.           * The student about.           * The student about a student strange students.		[The counseling Nutliple Solution     Phils]     The land/normalice list of songly suggest     a single solution path.     The land/normalice list of songly suggest     a solution path.     The land/normalice list of

#### Here's a closer Look...

#### ACTION 4.1 2011-11-3

#	Facet			
	rucce			
A	Giving Directions (for Individual or Group Work)	*Setting Process Expectations*	* Setting Product Expectations*	
		<ol> <li>Teacher tells students to get started without setting process expectations.</li> <li>Teacher sets process expectations (e.g., 2 amount of time for task, how students should organize themselves).</li> </ol>	<ul> <li>Teacher tells students to get started without setting product expectations.</li> <li>Teacher sets expectations about final product</li> <li>(e.g., by providing a scoring rubric, showing examples of high quality work).</li> </ul>	
в	Summarizing the	Who is Doing the Summarizing?	What is the Nature of the Math Being	
	Math Discussed		Summarizeu:	
		1	1	
		2	2	
		3	3	
	O			
с	Prior Knowledge	Who is Involved in Creating the Connections to Prior Knowledge?	What is the Nature of the Math Being Connected?	
		1 2 3	1 2 3	
D	Positioning Students Relative to Task	Who is Being Positioned as Capable of Doing the Math?	How/Why is the Math Being Learned Relevant/Useful?	What Does it Take to Be Successful in Math?
		1 Teacher tells students to work on task but doesn't position them relative to the task. Teacher positions students as capable of working on a difficult task, but addresses	Mathematics is not emphasized as important/relevant to students. Teacher talks about the importance of	<sup>1</sup> Teacher doesn't emphasize effort over ability. 2 Teacher emphasizes the importance of
		<ul> <li>students in a general way (e.g., you guys can do this).</li> <li>Teacher is explicit in positioning ALL students</li> </ul>	(e.g., you guys really need to know this). Utility of math is addressed specifically (e.g.	<ul> <li>effort.</li> <li>Teacher emphasizes the importance of</li> </ul>
		3 as capable of working on the task (e.g., multiple ability treatment).	3 students are positioned as having mathematical futures).	3 effort AND the need to be persistent in the face of difficulty.

#### And then I realized...

# Why not create equivalence classes, clustering all of these "things to look at" into meaningful categories? Here is the result...

#### The Five Dimensions of Powerful Mathematics Classrooms

The Mathematics	Cognitive Demand	Equitable Access to Mathematics	Agency, Ownership, and Identity	Formative Assessment
The extent to which classroom activity structures provide opportunities for students to become knowledgeable, flexible, and resourceful mathematical thinkers. Discussions are focused and coherent, providing opportunities to learn mathematical ideas, techniques,	The extent to which students have opportunities to grapple with and make sense of important mathematical ideas and their use. Students learn best when they are challenged in ways that provide room and support for growth, with task difficulty ranging	The extent to which classroom activity structures invite and support the active engagement of all of the students in the classroom with the core mathematical content being addressed by the class. Classrooms in which a small number of students get most of the "air	The extent to which students are provided opportunities to "walk the walk and talk the talk" – to contribute to conversations about mathematical ideas, to build on others' ideas and have others build on theirs – in ways that contribute to their development of agency (the willingness to engage), their	The extent to which classroom activities elicit student thinking and subsequent interactions respond to those ideas, building on productive beginnings and addressing emerging misunderstandings. Powerful instruction "meets students where they are" and
and perspectives,	from moderate to	time" are not	ownership over the	gives them
and develop	level of challenge	matter how rich the	development of	deepen their
productive	should be conducive	content: all students	positive identities as	understandings.
mathematical habits	to what has been	need to be involved	thinkers and learners.	
of mind.	called "productive	in meaningful ways.		
	struggle."			

Note how this framework focuses on the student point of view.

Four of the five dimensions have to do with the ways in which the students experience the mathematics.

# What's essential about this framework?

### Here are 5 central points.

Five central points about TRU:

1. The TRU Dimensions are necessary and sufficient. That is,

If things go well along all 5 dimensions, students will emerge from the classroom as powerful thinkers. If things go badly along *any* of the dimensions, they will not.

### Five central points about TRU:

- 2. TRU involves a fundamental shift in perspective, from teacher-centered to student-centered.
  - The key question is *not:* "Do I like what the teacher is doing?" It is:
  - "What does instruction feel like, from the point of view of the student?"

#### Observe the Lesson Through a Student's Eyes

The Content	<ul> <li>What's the big idea in this lesson?</li> <li>How does it connect to what I already know?</li> </ul>
Comitivo	<ul> <li>How long am I given to think, and to make sense of things?</li> </ul>
Demand	<ul> <li>What happens when I get stuck?</li> <li>Am I invited to explain things, or just give answers?</li> </ul>
Equitable Access	Do I get to participate in meaningful math learning?
to Content	• Can I hide or be ignored? In what ways am I kept engaged?
Agency, Ownership, and Identity	<ul> <li>What opportunities do I have to explain my ideas? In what ways are they built on?</li> <li>How am I recognized as being capable and able to contribute?</li> </ul>
Formative Assessment	<ul> <li>How is my thinking included in classroom discussions?</li> <li>Does instruction respond to my ideas and help me think more deeply?</li> </ul>

#### Five central points about TRU:

 TRU does not tell you how to teach, because there are many different ways to be an effective teacher.

TRU serves to *problematize* instruction. That is: Asking, "how am I doing along this dimension; how can I improve?" can lead to richer instruction without imposing a particular style or norms on teachers. Five central points about TRU:

4. TRU is NOT a tool or set of tools. TRU is a perspective regarding what counts in instruction, and TRU provides a language for talking about instruction in powerful ways. With this understanding, you can make use of any productive tools wisely.

#### But we have tools, of course...

#### See

### http://TRUFramework.org

Five central points about TRU:

5. TRU doesn't compete with other initiatives; it works with them and makes them stronger.

You can use it to "problematize" the approaches you take.
## The challenge(s), if you think TRU might be a useful frame:

How does one go about validating it (in my own Western context)?How does one build an R&D agenda?How does one compare and contrast internationally?

#### Validation, Part 1:

While creating the framework, look at videos of teachers known to be effective. Do they do well on the emerging framework?

### Validation, Part 2:

### Show people videos and see what they comment on. Are their comments consistent with the categories in the framework?

#### Validation, Part 3:

Create a scoring rubric. Use a database that has classroom videos as well as classroom scores on tests of mathematical thinking and problem solving. See if scores on the rubric correlate with scores on the math tests.

### Building an R&D Agenda, 1

### Create tools and make them widely available. See https://truframework.org/ and http://map.mathshell.org/...

		Q
TEACHING FOR ROB UNDERSTANDING FRAM	UST IEWORK	
HOME INTRODUCTION TOOLS OTHER RESOURCES PUBLICATIONS	PEOPLE CONTACT	
Interview of the second sec	Search	Q
What is the TRU framework?		

TRU is a framework for characterizing powerful learning environments in crisp and

-)→ C' @

(i) map.mathshell.org

🛅 Alan's Bookmark's 🔅 Most Visited 📄 News 🕒 Google

#### Mathematics Assessment Project ASSESSING 21<sup>st</sup> CENTURY MATH

Welcome to the Mathematics Assessment Project

Home About News Lessons Tasks Tests PD Modules TRU Framework Standards



The Mathematics Assessment Project is part of the <u>Math Design Collaborative</u> initiated by the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation. The project set out to design and develop well-engineered tools for formative and summative assessment that expose students' mathematical knowledge and reasoning, helping teachers guide them towards improvement and monitor progress. The tools are relevant to any curriculum that seeks to deepen students' understanding of mathematical concepts and develop their ability to apply that knowledge to non-routine problems.

More about the Math Assessment Project

#### Lessons

Tasks

Tests

PD Modules

**TRU Math Suite** 

#### Formative Assessment Lessons: Classroom Challenges

100 lessons for formative assessment, some focused on developing math concepts, others on solving non-routine problems. <u>A Brief Guide for teachers and administrators (PDF)</u> is recommended reading before using these lessons for the first time.

#### Summative Assessment Tasks

A set of 94 exemplar summative assessment tasks to illustrate the range of performance goals required by CCSSM. The tasks come with scoring rubrics and examples of scored student work.

#### **Prototype Tests**

Complete summative test forms and rubrics designed to help teachers and students monitor their progress using a range of task types similar to the 'Tasks' section.

#### Professional Development Modules

5 Prototype modules that encourage groups of teachers to explore the practical and pedagogical concepts behind the materials, such as formative assessment, collaborative learning and the use of unstructured problems.

#### The TRU Math Tools Suite

The Teaching for Robust Understanding of Mathematics (TRU Math) suite is a set of tools with applications in Professional Development and research based around a framework for characterizing powerful learning environments.

#### Tools for School and District Leaders

Mathematics Assessment Resource

Service

The MathNIC project has released free tools to help schools and school districts be more effective in organizing for improvement, supporting teaching and learning, and communicating with parents and the community. Visit <u>mathnic.org</u> for details.

#### **ICMI** Awards

Hugh Burkhardt and Malcolm Swan have received a prestigious award from ICMI for the team's work in Math Education. Read more...

#### **RFA/CRESST** Report

The *Classroom Challenges* are central to Research for Action's report on the <u>MDC's Influence</u> on Teaching and Learning.

#### Free to Schools

All our materials can be downloaded for free and may be reproduced as-is for noncommercial use. Precise terms vary between materials. Enquiries to: map.info@mathshell.org.

State district and CCSSI standards annear courtesu of their respective authors

### A Tool for Planning for and Reflecting on Teaching

### The *TRU Conversation Guide* is designed to foster reflective conversations about instruction.

#### Frame each dimension with questions:

#### **The Content**

*How do ideas from this unit/course develop in this lesson/lesson sequence?* 

**Cognitive Demand** 

What opportunities do students have to make their own sense of important ideas?

**Equitable Access to Content** 

Who does and does not participate in the meaningful work of the class, and how?

Agency, Ownership, and Identity

What opportunities do students have to explain their own and respond to each other's ideas?

**Formative Assessment** 

What do we know about each student's current thinking, and how can we build on it?

### ... and expand the questions,

to *problematize* instruction. That is: Ask a series of questions that help to plan for instruction that provides students with deeper opportunities along each of the five dimensions.

### **The TRU Conversation Guide**

#### Guide:

A Tool for Teacher Learning and Growth<sup>1</sup>

#### **The Mathematics**

Core Question: How do mathematical ideas from this unit/course develop in this lesson/lesson sequence?

Students often experience mathematics as a set of isolated facts, procedures and concepts, to be rehearsed, memorized, and applied. Our goal is to instead give students opportunities to experience mathematics as a coherent and meaningful discipline. This means identifying the important mathematical ideas behind facts and procedures, highlighting connections between skills and concepts, and relating concepts to each other-not just in a single lesson, but also across lessons and units. It also means engaging students with centrally important mathematics in an active way, so that they can make sense of concepts and ideas for themselves and develop robust networks of understanding.

The Mathematics							
Pre-observation Reflecting After a Lesson Planning Next Steps							
How will important mathematical ideas develop in this lesson and unit?	How did students actually engage with important mathematical ideas in this lesson?	How can we connect the mathematical ideas that surfaced in this lesson to future lessons?					
Think about:         •       The mathematical goals for the lesson.         •       What connections exist among important ideas in this lesson and important ideas in past and future lessons.         •       How math procedures in the lesson are justified and connected with important ideas.         •       How we see/hear students engage with mathematical ideas during class.         •       Which students get to engage deeply with important mathematical ideas.         •       How future instruction could create anoncrumities for more students to engage more deeply with							

mathematical ideas

Cognitive Demand								
Core Question: What opportunities do students have to make their own sense of mathematical ideas								
We want students to engage authentically with important mathematical ideas, not simply receive knowledge. This requires students to engage in productive struggle. They need to be supported in								
Equitable Access to Content								
go t Core Question: Who does and does not participate in the mathematical work of the class, and how?								
All stude to build	ents sho product	uld have	e access to opportunities to develop the bematical identities. For any number of	eir own understandings of rich mathema Freasons, it can be extremely difficult to	atics, and			
this according the third the	ess to e ze who l		Agency, Ow	nership, and Identi	ty			
ways of	organiz	Core C mathe	Question: What opportunities do stude ematical ideas?	ents have to explain their own and res	pond to each other's			
		Many st	tudents have negative beliefs about the	mselves and mathematics, for example	, that they are "bad at			
	Pre-c	math," o support	math," or that math is just a bunch of facts and formulas that they're supposed to memorize. Our goal is to support all students—especially those who have not been successful with mathematics in the past—to develop					
What of studer	opportu	capable	and competent—not by giving them ea	asy successes, but by engaging them as	sense-makers, problem			
mathe	matical	solvers	solvers Formative Assessment					
Think o	about:	Core Question: What do we know about each student's current mathematical thinking, and how ca build on it?						
0	What writing		We want instruction to be responsive to students' actual thinking, not just our hopes or assumptions about what they do and don't understand. It isn't always easy to know what students					
0	Which	What lessor	are thinking, much less to use thi	is information to shape classroom	activities—but we can craft tasks			
0	Which	<u>own</u> a	and ask purposetul questions that give us insights into the strategies students are using, the depth of their conceptual understanding, and so on. Our goal is to then use those insights to guide our					
0	What	mathe	instruction, not just to fix mistake	es but to integrate students' unde	rstandings, partial though they			
0	Langua How n	Think	may be, and build on them.					
	facilita	0	Fo	nt				
0	what ways t	0	Pre-observation	Reflecting After a Lesson	Planning Next Steps			
	studer	0	What do we know about each	What did we learn in this lesson	Based on what we learned about			
0	How to partici		student's current mathematical thinking, and how does this lesson	about each student's mathematical thinking? How was this thinking built	each student's mathematical thinking how can we (1) learn more			
		0	build on it?	on?	about it and (2) build on it?			
		0	<ul> <li>Think about:         <ul> <li>What opportunities exist for students to develop their own strategies and approaches.</li> <li>What opportunities exist for students to share their mathematical ideas and reasoning, and to connect their ideas to others'.</li> <li>What different ways students get to share their mathematical ideas and reasoning (writing on paper, speaking, writing on the</li> </ul> </li> </ul>					
<ul> <li>board, creating diagrams, demonstrating with manipulatives, etc.).</li> <li>Who students get to share their (ideas with (e.g., a partner, the whole class, the teacher).</li> <li>How students are likely to make sense of the mathematics in the lesson and what responses might build on that thinking.</li> <li>What things we can try (e.g. takks, lesson structures, nuestioning roomst such as those in EALs) to surface student thinking.</li> </ul>								
			, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,		,			
	Question tudents 2. This rc Core C All studit to build this acce recognit ways of to student mathe Think d 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	Question: What itudents to eng. This requires Core Question All students sho to build product this access to e recognize who productive active ways of organize What opporture student to partential Think about: O What What Which particion What S What O What O What S What O	Question: What opportu- itudents to engage aul- . This requires student Core Question: Who of All students should have to build productive mat- this access to e recognize who productive auti- ways of organiz What opportu- student to par mathematical Think about: 0 What 0 Which 0 What 0 Which 0 What 0 W	Cognitive Demand         Question: What opportunities do students have to make their ow         Link apportunities do students have to engage in productive struggle         Equitable Access         Core Question: Who does and does not participate in the me         All students should have access to opportunities to develop the to build productive mathematical identities. For any number of this access to erecognize who recognize who recognize who recognize who avays of organiz         Many students have negative beliefs about the math," or that math is just a bunch of facts and support all students – especially those who hava sense of mathematical agency and authority. capable and competent—not by giving them as solvers         Many students have negative beliefs about the math," or that math is just a bunch of facts and support all students – especially those who hava sense of mathematical agency and authority. capable and competent—not by giving them as solvers         Think about:         0       What         0       What	Cognitive Demand         Question: What opportunities do students have to make their own sense of mathematical ideas.         Automatical ideas, not simply receive.         Interquires students to engage in productive struggle. They need to be supported in         Core Question: Who does and does not participate in the mathematical work of the class, and how         All students should have access to opportunities to develop their own understandings of rich mathematical identifies. For any unmber of reasons. It can be extremely difficult to this access to erecognize who productive atternatical identifies. For any unmber of reasons. It can be extremely difficult to this access to erecognize who productive atternatical identifies. For any unmber of reasons. It can be extremely difficult to this access to erecognize who productive atternatical identifies. For any unmber of reasons. It can be extremely difficult to this access to erecognize who productive atternatical identifies. For any unmber of reasons. It can be extremely difficult to a support all students have negative beliefs about themselves and mathematics, for example math," or that math is just a bunch of facts and formulas that they're supposed to me capable and competent—not by giving the measy success. but by comparise thematical capable and competent—not by giving the measy success. but by comparise the thinking, assumptions about that do we know about each student's current mathematical instruction to be responsive to student's current mathematical instruction, not just to fix mistakes but to integrate students' under struction, not just to fix mistakes but to integrate students' under struction, not just to fix mistakes but to integrate students' under struction, not just to fix mistakes but to integrate student's mathe			

#### Agency, Ownership, and Identity

Core Questions: What opportunities do students have to see themselves and each other as powerful doers of mathematics? How can we create more of these opportunities?

Many students have negative beliefs about themselves and mathematics, for example, that they are "bad at math," or that math is just a bunch of facts and formulas that they're supposed to memorize. Our goal is to support all students—especially those who have not been successful with mathematics in the past—to develop a sense of mathematical agency and ownership over their own learning. We want students to come to see themselves as mathematically capable and competent—not by giving them easy successes, but by engaging them as sense-makers, problem solvers, and creators of mathematical ideas.



#### Planning

What opportunities might exist for students to generate and explain their own ideas? To respond to each other's ideas? How can we create more opportunities?

#### Reflecting

How have we seen students explain their own and respond to each other's ideas? What has that looked and sounded like in specific cases?



#### Things to think about

- Who generates the ideas that get discussed?
- What kinds of ideas do students have opportunities to generate and share (strategies, connections, partial understandings, prior knowledge, representations)?
- Who evaluates and/or responds to others' ideas?
- How deeply do students get to explain their ideas?
- How does (or how could) the teacher respond to student ideas (evaluating, questioning, probing, soliciting responses from other students, etc.)?
- How are norms about students' and teachers' roles in generating ideas developing?
- How are norms about what counts as mathematical activity (justifying, experimenting, connecting, practicing, memorizing, etc.) developing?
- Which students get to explain their own ideas? To respond to others' ideas in meaningful ways?
- Which students seem to see themselves as powerful mathematical thinkers right now?
- How might we create more opportunities for more students to see themselves and each other as powerful mathematical thinkers?

To support collegial observations,

### we offer the

### **TRU Observation Guide,**

Which highlights things to look for is a lesson is going well.

The guide can be used by coaches or TLCs for planning and debriefing classroom observations...

### **The TRU Observation Guide**

#### The TRU Observation Guide: A Tool for Teachers, Coaches, and Professional Learning Communities

#### THE CONTENT

Teachers

The extent to which central disciplinary ideas and methods, as represented by State or National Standards, are present and embodied in instruction. Every student should have opportunities to This TRU grapple meaningfully with important ideas and to develop productive disciplinary habits of mind. coaches, Teachers should have opportunities to consider and discuss how each lesson's objective connects to (TRU) Fra one obse the big ideas and practices they want students to develop over time.

Engages with grade level content in ways that highlight important information, concepts, and methods Has opportunities to develop	<ul> <li>Highlight important ideas and provide opportunities for students to engage with them</li> <li>Use materials or assignments that center on key ideas, connections, and applications</li> </ul>			
productive disciplinary habits of mind Has opportunities to reason about disciplinary issues, both orally and in writing, using appropriate academic language	<ul> <li>Explicitly connect the lesson's big ideas to what has come before and will be done in the future</li> <li>Support the purposeful use of academic language and other representations central to the discipline</li> </ul>			

Explains their reasoning processes as · Support students in seeing the discipline as being well as their answers. coherent, connected, and comprehensible

 Other focal points for observation: Tool for I

#### We are i Suggeste

demand

highlight

classroo

produce

The mos

planning

by reflect Guide, w

This Guie

Californi Foundati

Improver (Grant Ol

Impleme

Universi

Fach Student

Schoenfe What are the big ideas in this lesson? How do they connect to what has come before, and/or tool for t establish a base for future work? How do the ways students engage with the material support the Educatio development of conceptual understanding and the development of disciplinary habits of mind?

This mat other rig



#### COGNITIVE DEMAND

The extent t	o which classroo	m interaction	s create and maintain an environment of a	productive inlingry content			
and practices. We seek "productive struggle"							
Each studer • Engage: with chi	EQUITABLE ACCESS TO CONTENT The extent to which classroom activities invite and support the meaningful engagement with core content by all students. Finding ways to support the diverse range of learners in engaging						
<ul> <li>With chi</li> <li>Actively their cu</li> <li>Works t</li> <li>habits c</li> <li>Reason: connect know</li> <li>Explain: before i</li> <li>Other foc</li> <li>Other foc</li> <li>What oppo they suppo so that they</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>meaningfully i</li> <li>Each student</li> <li>Contribute making in : different w ideas, askii diagrams</li> <li>Actively lis and builds</li> <li>Supports o developing</li> <li>Explains, ir reflects on</li> <li>Participate disciplinar</li> <li>Other focal \$</li> </ul>	The extent on emergin academica Each stude • Takes c in plan on indi • Asks qu that su applyin • Builds c help ot • Holds c accoun througi elabora	AGENCY, OWNERSHIP, AND IDENTITY         to which every student has opportunities to explore, conjecture, reason, explain, and build g ideas, contributing to the development of agency (the willingness to engage         FORMATIVE ASSESSMENT         The extent to which classroom activities elicit all students' thinking and subsequent interactions respond to that thinking, by building on productive beginnings or by addressing emerging misunderstandings. High quality instruction "meets students where they are" and gives them opportunities to develop deeper understandings, both as shaped by the teacher and in student-to- student.         Each student       Teachers         Each student       Create safe climates in which students feel free to express their ideas and understandings         Sees errors as opportunities for new learning       Create safe climates in which students feel free to express their ideas and understandings         Sees fellow students as resources for their own learning       Use materials that elicit multiple strategies, and have students explain their reasoning, in order to gain information about student" emerging understandings         Provides specific and accurate feedback to fellow students       Provide timely and specific feedback to students, as part of classroom routines for a students to make active use of feedback to further their learning         Other focal points for observation:       What opportunities exist for all students to demonstrate their understandings? What opportunities exist to build on the thinking that is revealed? How do teachers and/or other students take up these opportunities? Where can more be created?				ractions g them tudent-to- ee to express and have gain tandings s students
Goal: All stu	In what ways ( every student	Other for     What oppc     thinkers, tc     and demor					
deeper und	Goal: All stude the class. Dive strategies, res	Goal: All s to engage					
	Goal: Every student's learning is continually enhanced by the ongoing strategic and flexible use of techniques and activities that allow students to reveal their emerging understandings, and that provide opportunities both to rethink misunderstandings to build op productive ideas						

#### AGENCY, OWNERSHIP, AND IDENTITY

The extent to which every student has opportunities to explore, conjecture, reason, explain, and build on emerging ideas, contributing to the development of agency (the willingness to engage academically) and ownership over the content, resulting in positive mathematical identities.

Each student...

#### Teachers...

•	Takes ownership of the learning process in planning, monitoring, and reflecting oh individual and/or collective work	•	Provide time for students to develop and express mathematical ideas and reasoning Work to make sure all students have
•	Asks questions and makes suggestions that		opportunities to have their voices heard
	support analyzing, evaluating, applying	•	Encourage student-to-student discussions and
	and synthesizing mathematical ideas		promote productive exchanges
•	Builds on the contributions of others and	•	Assign tasks and pose questions that call for
	help others see or make connections		mathematical justification, and for students to
•	Holds classmates and themselves		explain their reasoning
	accountable for justifying their positions,	٠	Employ a range of techniques that attribute
	through the use of evidence and/or		ideas to students, to build student ownership
	elaborating on their reasoning		and identity

• Other focal points for observation:

What opportunities do all students have to see themselves and others as proficient mathematical thinkers, to grapple with challenges and construct new understandings, to build on others' ideas, and demonstrate their understandings? How can more of these opportunities be created?

Goal: All students build productive mathematical identities through taking advantage of opportunities to engage meaningfully with the discipline and share and refine their developing ideas.

The first version of the Observation Guide was actually built by San Francisco Unified School District, and it's being used in a number of school districts across the US.

So, these ideas work at the "ground level." They're not just "academic."

### Building an R&D Agenda, 2

As suggested above, make your tools widely available so other researchers can use them. Collaborate with school districts to get "real world data."

#### **Collaborations:**

TRU is used in New York, Chicago, and San Francisco. Many of our partners are building tools, adding to the work. Colleagues in China, England, France, Germany, Japan, Israel, and Singapore are also working with the ideas.

### Building an R&D Agenda, 3

Look into mechanism. \* What kinds of teacher learning communities can we support? \* How do we document changes in teacher understanding? In teachers' practices?

\* In student behavior, as well as student learning?

### **International Comparisons**

I am particularly interested in how these ideas do or do not make sense in China. From what I know, there are some systematic differences in cultural context:

#### Comparisons with China, Issue 1

In China there is more of a focus on the teaching and the lesson, less on the students (compare Chinese and Japanese Lesson Study, for example). Does TRU, which is student-focused, seem too strange?

### Comparisons with China, Issue 2

TRU Dimension 4, "Agency, Ownership, and Identity" is a very Western idea. Does it make sense in the Chinese context?

#### Comparisons with China to come...

I am collaborating with Yu-Liang Chang (張宇樑) from Taiwan. It will be good to see what directions our collaborations take, and if they can spread!

### Thank you!



Extras, part 1: What happens when people look at classroom videos. Every time a group looks at videos, there are lots of comments about what the teachers are doing, and what it must feel like to be a student in their classrooms.

# And every time, it is easy to organize everything they say into five categories.

### Let's see what we've got...

MATHEMATICS

SurFace guestions explanations tasks afford mathematics teacher's mathe us students mathe. just Vocabulary, not mathematics discuss mathematics statexplanation of mattendial thinking prompts bocus (or not) on methematics one word responses us. share thinking dialogue that incovers math misconceptions Making math meaning vs. answers a bits multiple strategies connections across representations to get bats vs. modulities Concept different thinking from rigorous tack

### The Mathematics

Is it important, coherent, connected? Where are the big ideas? Are there opportunities for thinking and problem solving?

Cognitic Demand . Surface guestions · tasks allowed for st. discussion - structure t, s-s, t-s · representations (multiple) Support St discussion nature of activity is important dialogue supports exploration of misconceptions is lesson making meaning for kids ? Size of math "chunk" ? Istratesy "chunk"

· TEASUNING

### Cognitive Demand

Do the students have opportunities for sense making – for "productive struggle," engaging productively with the mathematics?

ACCESS

Student - student cole of teacher language of mathomatics discourse in group work Classroom rulture Opening space for students to talk Safe due to task

### Access and Equity

Who participates, in what ways? Are there opportunities for *every* student to engage in sense making?

AGENCY IDENTITY STUDENT EXPLANATION (2) (3) DEBATE, CHALLENGE RoomFor Student discussion (Teacher talk+Role Change Post-TRAUMATIC Math Syndrome (Role of discourse, nature of activity, comminity (CLOSSROOM (UITURE TASKS MAKE ROCIN

### Agency and Identity

Do students have the opportunities to do and talk mathematics? Do they come to see themselves as "math people," or people who cannot do mathematics?



### Formative Assessment

Does classroom discussion reveal what students understand, so that instruction can be adjusted for purposes of helping students learn?

### Do these tools make a difference?

### Here are some data.

#### Implementation and Effects of LDC and MDC in Kentucky Districts

Joan Herman, Scott Epstein, Seth Leon, Deborah La Torre Matrundola, Sarah Reber, and Kilchan Choi

Policy Brief No. 13 MDC = "Math design Collaborative," which was designed to help implement the Formative Assessment Lessons.

The results:



National Center for Research on Evaluation, Standards, & Student Testing

UCLA | Graduate School of Education & Information Studies

Participating teachers were expected to implement between four and six Formative Assessment Lessons, meaning that students were engaged only 8-12 days of the school year.

Nonetheless, the studies found statistically significant learning effects of approximately **4.6 months** for the Formative Assessment Lessons.

### Why?

The teachers learn TRU-related techniques that they use in their regular instruction – our desired "multiplier effect."
# Here's a recent study:





## MDC's Influence on Teaching and Learning

Prepared by Research for Action February 2015

#### 1. MDC Helps Implement the Core Common State Standards



The vast majority of teachers reported that the Classroom Challenges were supporting their implementation of the Core Common State Standards. As one high school math teacher said:

I do [think participating in MDC will help me teach the Common Core]. Because the common core is all about "do fewer things better." We want to be able to get into these investigative things, and we want to be able to emphasize reasoning over mechanics, and so this is dead on that.

#### 2. MDC Supports Teaching as Coaching

Almost all participating teachers indicated that the role of teacher as instructional "facilitator" or "coach," which is embodied in the Challenges, supports increasing students' mathematical understanding. Compared to providing direct instruction, coaching enables students to take on a more active learning role.



Teachers agreed that the teacher taking on the role of facilitator coach strengthens students' mathematical understanding. I've been teaching for 36 years, and teaching the same way. It's hard to change; to teach an old dog new tricks. But now that I'm doing it, I love it....At first, I felt like, I'm not teaching! [laughs] But now I realize that they really are learning, and doing more on their own. And I don't have to stand up there, and teach my heart out, and they [are] just looking at me and still not getting it. Now...they're probably learning more. – High school math teacher

#### 3. MDC is Raising Teachers' Expectations

The Classroom Challenges are rooted in the rigorous demands of the CCSS and designed to raise the level of mathematical content in instruction. Teachers reported that the Classroom Challenges were increasing their academic expectations for their students.



Teacher respondents agreed that using the MDC Classroom Challenges raised their expectations for students' mathematical work.

### 4. MDC Provides Effective Teaching Strategies and Changes Overall Instruction



The vast majority of MDC teachers reported that the lessons provided them with effective strategies for teaching math and strengthening mathematical discourse in their classrooms.

The students actually talk about math and they are actually having debates and they are debating between who is correct. Before, without this type of teaching, they never talked about math. It was always the teacher talking and they never got into good discussions or justify their answers, and they were never responsible for understanding what other people were thinking as well. – High school math teacher

In addition, teachers reported that MDC practices were affecting their instruction, even when they weren't using the Challenges.



At least three-quarters of MDC teachers said that the lessons had become important to their instructional practice and that they were infusing strategies from the Classroom Challenges into their ongoing instruction.

High school math teachers reported:

This has expanded me to do more work in groups, even more than I have done in the past.

I think it's helping us grow as teachers in how we question the students.

It has definitely made me more aware of putting the responsibility on them-for them to be their own learners and I love the questioning technique and being their facilitator to learning. It has definitely changed my way of teaching.

#### 5. MDC Offers Formative Assessment



Large majorities of MDC teachers agreed that using the lessons helped them incorporate more formative assessment in their classes, learn information about students' math strengths and weaknesses and give students more detailed feedback about their work. In interviews, teachers reported that analyzing the pre-assessment and post-assessment enabled them to identify gaps in student knowledge and detect growth. Teachers also reported using information about students' misconceptions to develop feedback questions or re-teach content.